



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
13th September 2011, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,  
William James Bailhache, Esquire.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ben Edward Shenton – en défaut (défaut raised at 11.51 a.m.)  
Connétable Alan Simon Crowcroft of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.51 a.m.)  
Connétable Daniel Joseph Murphy of Grouville – excused attendance  
Connétable Graeme Frank Butcher of St. John – ill  
Connétable John Martin Refault of St. Peter – en défaut  
Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.09 a.m.)  
Deputy Daniel John Arabin Wimberley of St. Mary – ill  
Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.51 a.m.)

---

Prayers

---

**Documents presented or laid**

States of Jersey Complaints Board: findings – complaint against a decision of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding the property known as ‘Transvaal’, La Rue de Fauvic, Grouville. R.112/2011.  
Presented: 13th September 2011.  
*Privileges and Procedures Committee.*

**Withdrawal of lodged propositions**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

Medium Term Financial Plan: minimum lodging period. P.120/2011.  
Lodged: 28th June 2011.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (P.123/2011): amendment. P.123/2011.  
Lodged: 19th August 2011. Amd.  
*Senator F. du H. Le Gresley.*

Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (P.123/2011): sixth amendment (Paragraphs (a), (b), (c), (d), (g), (h), (l), (m) and (u)) P.123/2011.  
Lodged: 30th August 2011. Amd.(6)  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (P.123/2011): ninth amendment (paragraphs 1 and 2). P.123/2011.  
 Lodged: 30th August 2011. Amd.(9)  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

Standing Orders: Answers to Questions. P.132/2011.  
 Lodged: 3rd August 2011.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

### **Annual Business Plan 2012 P.123/2011**

THE STATES commenced consideration of paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (P.123/2011) and rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister’s Department should be increased by £60,000 to enable the Statistics Unit to produce a ‘Relative Cost of Living’ comparator between Jersey and the United Kingdom by 2013 and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) should be reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 15**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

#### **CONTRE: 28**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012, agreed that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister’s Department should be increased by £18,400,100, (£10,194,500 in respect of the Information Services Department, £4,395,500 in respect of the Human Resources Department and £3,810,100 in respect of the PECRS pre-1987 debt) by transferring responsibility for the Information Services and Human Resources Departments back to the Chief Minister’s Department on a permanent basis, and the total net revenue of the Treasury and Resources Department should be reduced by £18,400,100.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 31**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES commenced consideration of paragraph(1) of an amendment of Senator Francis du Heaume Le Gresley to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Economic Development Department should be increased by £1,000,000 in order to provide a grant in this amount to the Tourism Development Fund in 2012.”

THE STATES, following discussion, granted leave to Senator Francis du Heaume Le Gresley to withdraw his amendment (Amendment 3, paragraph 1) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012.

THE STATES was informed by the Deputy Bailiff that, as he was absent from the Assembly and had been declared ‘malade’, the amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (Amendment 12) was deemed to have fallen away.

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chief Minister, agreed, in accordance with paragraph (5) of Article 11(5) of the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2005, that his amendment to paragraph (a) of the Annual Business Plan 2012 (Amendment 15) could be debated at the current meeting.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Chief Minister to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012, agreed that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Education, Sport and Culture Department should be reduced by £15,000 and the net revenue expenditure of the Home Affairs Department should be increased by £15,000 to reflect a transfer of funding in this amount to the Building a Safer Society service area in the Home Affairs Department for 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 42**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES was informed by the Deputy Bailiff that, as he was absent from the Assembly and had been declared ‘malade’, the amendments of the Deputy of St. Mary to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (Amendment 13, Paragraphs 1 to 5) were deemed to have fallen away.

THE STATES commenced consideration of paragraph (2) of an amendment of Senator Ben Edward Shenton to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by £100,000 in order to increase funding for the Alcohol and Drugs Service”.

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade that the meeting should adjourn for lunch, before completing consideration of this amendment.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

**CONTRE: 27**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator B.E. Shenton

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)	Connétable of St. Saviour
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)	Connétable of St. Clement
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)	Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy of St. John	Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy M. Tadier (B)	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Deputy of St. Ouen
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy S. Pitman (H)
	Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
	Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
	Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
	Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
	Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
	Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

THE STATES, having resumed consideration of paragraph (2) of an amendment of Senator Ben Edward Shenton to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012, rejected the proposition that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by £100,000 in order to increase funding for the Alcohol and Drugs Service”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 20**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 27**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

### Changes in Presidency

THE STATES re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Bailiff.

### Annual Business Plan 2012 P.123/2011

THE STATES resumed consideration of paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (P.123/2011) and rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

- |  |          |
|--|----------|
| (e) Review Occupational Therapy Services, less essential SLA annual increases and other efficiency savings | £100,000 |
|--|----------|

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### POUR: 13

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisse (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

#### CONTRE: 31

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)

#### ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(f) Review process pathways in the hospital to improve efficiency	£175,000
---	----------

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 9**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 36**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**



Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(i) Redesign of Respite Services	£65,000
----------------------------------	---------

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 19**

Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 25**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator P.F. Routier

Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(j) A&E – appropriate use of service £50,000

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(k) Workforce efficiencies review	£50,000
-----------------------------------	---------

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 9**

**CONTRE: 35**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John

Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(n) Patient Transport: Review PTS provision (user pays)	£46,000
---	---------

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 17**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 28**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

- |  |         |
|--|---------|
| (o) A proposal to move smoking cessation support services into a community setting (user pays) | £94,000 |
|--|---------|

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) be reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 8**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 37**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisser (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(p) Introduce an A and E charging mechanism (user pays)	£94,000
---	---------

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

**CONTRE: 31**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisser (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

- |  |         |
|--|---------|
| (q) Review the thresholds for travel to the UK for<br>elective surgery (user pays) | £94,000 |
|--|---------|

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 11**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisse (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 34**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

- (r) Consider the re-introduction of prescription charges        £78,000  
by H&SS (user pays)

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 17**

Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator A. Breckon  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of Trinity  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

**CONTRE: 26**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –



“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

- |  |         |
|--|---------|
| (s) Surgical specialties: non-urgent cosmetic procedures (user pays) | £32,000 |
|--|---------|

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 8**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 36**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator A. Breckon  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Health and Social Services Department should be increased by the amounts shown below to enable the cancellation of the draft CSR savings and user pays proposals for 2012 –

(t) Income generation initiatives within Community and Social Services (user pays)	£31,000
--	---------

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Restructuring Costs) reduced by an equivalent sum in 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Home Affairs Department should be increased by £39,000 in order to cancel the proposed CSR saving ‘Jersey Field Squadron – Military Liaison Officer staff reduction’ and the total net revenue of the Treasury and Resources Department (Provision for Central Reserves) should be reduced by £39,000 for 2012.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 13**

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

**CONTRE: 28**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Senator Ben Edward Shenton to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2012” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department should be decreased by £120,000”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 18**

Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 26**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0****Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 14th September 2011 to continue consideration of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2012 (P.123/2011) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.26 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE**

*Greffier of the States*